Parallel Tracking and Verifying: A Framework for Real-Time and High Accuracy Visual Tracking

Heng Fan Haibin Ling

Meitu HiScene Lab, HiScene Information Technologies, Shanghai, China Department of Computer and Information Sciences, Temple University, Philadelphia, PA USA {hengfan, hbling}@temple.edu

1. Siamese networks for verification

1.1. Architecture

Figure 1 shows the detailed architecture of siamese networks. Note that there are only two max pooling layers after conv1-2 and conv2-2 because too many max pooling layers may reduce the spatial information in features. Table 1 demonstrates the parameters of each layer. The source code of PTAV will be released for reproducible research.

1.2. Network training

We use the ALOV dataset [14] to train the siamese networks. Note that we exclude all videos that appear in OT-B2013 [17], OTB2015 [18] and TC128 [9]. After removing these sequences, the training dataset and the evaluation datasets have no common objects. As in [15], we generate multiple pairs using every two frames in a video. One element in the pair is the groundtruth bounding box in one frame and the other one is a box sampled in the other frame. The pair is considered to be positive if the sampled box has a intersection-over-union overlap larger than 0.7 with the corresponding groundtruth box and considered to be negative if the overlap is smaller than 0.5. The training pairs and validation pairs are generated from different videos, and therefore from different objects. For training, in total we have sampled 60, 000 pairs of frames from ALOV dataset and each pair has 128 pairs of boxes. For validation, we have gathered 2, 000 pairs of frames and the same as for training each pair of frames contains 128 pairs of boxes.

We use the pre-trained network parameters from VG-GNet [13] to initialize the networks. The initial learning rate is 0.001 and the weight decay parameter is 0.001. The learning rate is decreased by a factor of 10 after every 2 epochs. Training stops when the validation loss does not decrease any more.

2. Detailed results on OTB2015 [18]

In this supplementary material, detailed results on OT-B2015 [18] with 100 videos are provided. Table 2 shows the per-video distance precisions for all trackers in comparison. Note that table 2 also contains the results on OTB2013 [17]. Figure 2 and Figure 3 show the distance precision plots and overlap successful plots for all 11 attributes, respectively.

3. Detailed results on TC128 [9]

We also present detailed results on the TC128 [9] with 128 videos. The per-video distance precision for all trackers in our comparison are reported in table 3. Figure 4 and Figure 5 show the distance precision plots and overlap successful plots for all 11 attributes, respectively.

4. Detailed results on UAV20L [12]

We present detailed results on the UAV20L [12] with 20 long videos. The shortest video contains 1717 frames, and the longest video contains 5527 frames. The per-video distance precision for all trackers in our comparison are reported in table 4. Figure 6 and Figure 7 show the distance precision plots and overlap successful plots for all 12 attributes, respectively.

References

- L. Bertinetto, J. Valmadre, S. Golodetz, O. Miksik, and P. H. Torr. Staple: Complementary learners for real-time tracking. In *CVPR*, 2016. 3, 6
- M. Danelljan, G. Hager, F. S. Khan, and M. Felsberg. Discriminative scale space tracking. *IEEE TPAMI*, 2016. 3, 6, 9
- [3] M. Danelljan, G. Hager, F. Shahbaz Khan, and M. Felsberg. Learning spatially regularized correlation filters for visual tracking. In *ICCV*, 2015. 3, 6, 9



Figure 1. The detailed architecture of siamese networks.

Table 1. Parameters of the siamese networks.											
Layer name	Conv1-1	Conv1-2	Max pooling1	Conv2-1	Conv2-2	Max pooling2					
Parameters	3x3x64	3x3x64	2x2	3x3x128	3x3x128	2x2					
Layer name	Conv3-1	Conv3-2	Conv3-3	Conv4-1	Conv4-2	Conv4-3					
Parameters	3x3x256	3x3x256	3x3x256	3x3x512	3x3x512	3x3x512					
Layer name	Conv5-1	Conv5-2	Conv5-3	ROI pooling1	ROI pooling2	ROI pooling3					
Parameters	3x3x512	3x3x512	3x3x512	7x7	7x7	7x7					

- [4] J. Gao, H. Ling, W. Hu, and J. Xing. Transfer learning based visual tracking with gaussian processes regression. In *ECCV*, 2014. 3
- [5] S. Hare, S. Golodetz, A. Saffari, V. Vineet, M.-M. Cheng, S. L. Hicks, and P. H. Torr. Struck: Structured output tracking with kernels. *IEEE TPAMI*, 38(10):2096–2109, 2016. 3, 6, 9
- [6] J. F. Henriques, R. Caseiro, P. Martins, and J. Batista. Highspeed tracking with kernelized correlation filters. *IEEE TPA-MI*, 37(3):583–596, 2015. 3, 6, 9
- Z. Hong, Z. Chen, C. Wang, X. Mei, D. Prokhorov, and D. Tao. Multi-store tracker (muster): A cognitive psychology inspired approach to object tracking. In *CVPR*, 2015.
- [8] Y. Li and J. Zhu. A scale adaptive kernel correlation filter tracker with feature integration. In *ECCV Workshop*, 2014.
- [9] P. Liang, E. Blasch, and H. Ling. Encoding color information for visual tracking: Algorithms and benchmark. *IEEE TIP*, 24(12):5630–5644, 2015. 1, 6, 7, 8
- [10] C. Ma, J.-B. Huang, X. Yang, and M.-H. Yang. Hierarchical convolutional features for visual tracking. In *ICCV*, 2015. 3, 9
- [11] C. Ma, X. Yang, C. Zhang, and M.-H. Yang. Long-term correlation tracking. In CVPR, 2015. 6, 9
- [12] M. Mueller, N. Smith, and B. Ghanem. A benchmark and simulator for uav tracking. In *ECCV*, 2016. 1, 9, 10, 11
- [13] K. Simonyan and A. Zisserman. Very deep convolutional networks for large-scale image recognition. In *ICLR*, 2014.

- [14] A. W. Smeulders, D. M. Chu, R. Cucchiara, S. Calderara, A. Dehghan, and M. Shah. Visual tracking: An experimental survey. *IEEE TPAMI*, 36(7):1442–1468, 2014. 1
- [15] R. Tao, E. Gavves, and A. W. Smeulders. Siamese instance search for tracking. In *CVPR*, 2016. 1, 3
- [16] N. Wang and D.-Y. Yeung. Learning a deep compact image representation for visual tracking. In *NIPS*, 2013. 3
- [17] Y. Wu, J. Lim, and M.-H. Yang. Online object tracking: A benchmark. In CVPR, 2013. 1
- [18] Y. Wu, J. Lim, and M.-H. Yang. Object tracking benchmark. *IEEE TPAMI*, 37(9):1834–1848, 2015. 1, 3, 4, 5
- [19] J. Zhang, S. Ma, and S. Sclaroff. Meem: robust tracking via multiple experts using entropy minimization. In *ECCV*, 2014. 3, 6, 9

Table 2. A	per-video	compa	rison on t	the OTB2	015 [<mark>18</mark>].	The best	two result	ts are hig	hlighted	with <mark>red</mark>	and blue	e fonts (la	ast row of	f table).
		PTAV	HCF [10]	SRDCF [3]	Staple [1]	MEEM [19]	SINT [15]	LCT [10]	fDSST [2]	KCF [6]	TGPR [4]	Struck [5]	DLT [16]	
	CarDark Car4	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.964	1.000	1.000	0.953	1.000	1.000	0.715	
	David	0.994	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.904	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.987	0.329	0.321	
	David2	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.711	
	Sylvester	0.914	0.852	0.845	0.850	0.954	0.977	0.975	0.837	0.843	0.946	0.995	0.770	
	Trellis	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.996	0.968	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.981	0.877	0.339	
	Mhyang	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	
	Soccer	0.941	0.816	0.934	0.296	0.314	0.531	0.151	0.946	0.791	0.143	0.253	0.138	
	Matrix	0.390	0.620	0.370	0.150	0.640	0.760	0.360	0.390	0.170	0.110	0.120	0.010	
	Ironman	0.596	0.645	0.030	0.145	0.506	0.614	0.145	0.078	0.217	0.096	0.114	0.127	
	Skating 1	1.000	1.000	0.898	1.000	0.693	0.433	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.700	0.465	0.042	
	Shaking	0.978	0.868	0.014	0.019	0.995	0.981	0.984	0.953	0.019	0.641	0.192	0.926	
	Singer1	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.470	0.521	1.000	1.000	0.843	0.219	0.641	1.000	
	Singer2	0.926	0.041	0.973	1.000	0.038	0.732	0.973	0.904	0.948	0.954	0.036	0.036	
	Coke	0.966	1.000	0.818	1.000	0.945	0.969	1.000	0.890	0.838	0.942	0.948	0.340	
	Boy	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	
	Dudek	0.876	0.905	0.833	0.822	0.792	0.930	0.907	0.876	0.877	0.681	0.897	0.918	
	Crossing	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.950	1.000	1.000	
	Couple	0.914	0.921	1.000	0.679	1.000	0.871	0.571	0.600	0.257	0.107	0.736	0.307	
	Jogging-1	0.974	0.974	0.784	0.228	0.964	0.980	0.973	0.231	0.235	0.225	0.241	0.228	
	Jogging-2	0.935	1.000	0.997	0.192	0.971	0.977	0.974	0.163	0.163	0.997	0.254	0.173	
	Doll	0.968	0.978	0.993	0.993	0.985	0.959	0.981	0.994	0.968	0.971	0.919	0.957	
	Girl	0.918	1.000	0.994	0.868	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.916	0.864	0.904	1.000	0.776	
	Walking2 Walking	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.982	0.748	
	Fleetface	0.710	0.590	0.597	0.628	0.591	0.714	0.549	0.625	0.460	0.393	0.639	0.434	
	Freeman1	0.951	0.979	0.948	1.000	0.997	0.402	0.972	0.951	0.402	0.985	0.801	0.380	
	Freeman3	0.913	0.811	0.996	0.915	0.985	0.935	0.783	0.917	0.911	0.122	0.789	1.000	
	Freeman4 David3	0.799	0.943	0.996	0.703	0.565	0.339	0.951	0.194	0.534	0.519	0.375	0.346	
	Jumping	0.974	1.000	1.000	0.307	1.000	0.978	0.978	0.946	0.342	0.109	1.000	0.962	
	CarScale	0.813	0.627	0.778	0.853	0.651	0.627	0.730	0.813	0.806	0.806	0.647	0.714	
	Skiing	0.086	0.988	0.074	0.160	1.000	1.000	0.136	0.086	0.074	0.111	0.037	0.123	
	Dog1	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.982	0.850	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.996	0.996	
	Suv MotorRolling	0.978	0.979	0.975	0.978	0.743	0.957	0.980	0.978	0.979	0.531	0.572	1.000	
	MountainBike	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.917	0.921	0.996	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.921	0.811	
	Lemming	0.939	0.258	0.323	0.273	0.911	0.875	0.856	0.275	0.487	0.275	0.628	0.298	
	Liquor	0.852	0.816	0.982	0.982	0.925	0.856	0.789	0.975	0.976	0.657	0.390	0.357	
	Woman Engeografi	0.938	0.940	0.988	0.998	0.963	0.936	0.940	0.938	0.938	0.940	1.000	0.938	
	Faceocc2	0.998	0.994	0.841	0.988	0.986	0.814	0.998	1.000	0.972	0.979	1.000	0.850	
	Basketball	0.930	1.000	0.996	0.879	0.892	0.866	1.000	0.913	0.923	0.993	0.120	0.086	
	Football	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.801	0.992	0.166	1.000	1.000	0.796	1.000	0.751	0.296	
	Subway	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.983	0.023	
	Tiger?	0.828	0.567	0.937	0.974	0.822	0.685	0.803	0.097	0.851	0.209	0.175	0.435	
	Biker	0.514	0.521	0.514	0.514	0.535	0.549	0.507	0.514	0.507	0.514	0.556	0.958	
	Bird1	0.373	0.392	0.071	0.363	0.289	0.453	0.346	0.373	0.069	0.811	0.150	0.588	
	Bird2	0.848	0.980	0.535	0.960	1.000	0.970	0.778	0.848	0.475	0.737	0.545	0.202	
	Blurbody Blurcar1	0.997	0.991	0.997	0.988	0.880	0.491	0.967	0.997	0.584	0.790	0.814	0.045	
	Blurcar2	1.000	0.961	1.000	1.000	0.959	0.856	0.998	1.000	0.938	0.962	0.916	0.749	
	Blurcar3	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.986	1.000	0.683	1.000	1.000	0.994	0.042	1.000	0.252	
	Blurcar4	0.997	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.976	0.800	1.000	0.997	0.997	0.937	0.997	0.563	
	Blurface	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.998	0.990	0.937	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.990	0.436	0.191	
	Board	0.930	0.962	0.984	0.472	0.995	0.529	0.891	0.937	0.228	0.053	0.989	0.570	
	Bolt2	0.696	0.952	0.017	0.997	0.017	0.014	0.017	0.017	0.017	0.020	0.109	0.973	
	Box	0.924	0.394	0.415	0.414	0.370	0.960	0.068	0.396	0.415	0.294	0.239	0.396	
	Carl	1.000	0.391	1.000	1.000	0.196	0.350	0.438	1.000	0.739	0.337	0.334	1.000	
	Car24	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.942	0.853	1.000	1.000	0.992	0.170	1.000	
	ClifBar	1.000	0.915	0.945	0.697	0.915	0.572	0.939	1.000	0.445	0.146	0.581	0.464	
	Coupon	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.394	0.388	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.388	1.000	0.382	
	Crowds	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.991	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.911	0.916	
	Dancer?	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.916	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.964	1.000	0.964	
	Diving	0.405	0.753	0.391	0.363	0.209	0.433	0.753	0.400	0.535	0.214	0.521	0.256	
	Dog	0.992	1.000	1.000	0.992	1.000	1.000	0.756	0.992	0.992	0.992	0.945	0.961	
	DragonBaby	0.442	0.867	0.336	0.858	0.823	0.850	0.549	0.389	0.336	0.752	0.106	0.372	
	Girl2 Gum	0.955	0.076	0.075	0.087	0.801	0.746	0.076	0.080	0.071	0.577	0.272	0.074	
	Human2	0.441	0.540	0.848	0.894	0.180	0.797	0.595	0.160	0.171	0.738	0.432	0.556	
	Human3	0.975	0.035	0.034	0.034	0.866	0.068	0.006	0.006	0.006	0.010	0.010	0.009	
	Human4	0.828	0.852	1.000	0.958	0.504	0.597	0.852	0.204	0.534	0.508	0.211	0.205	
	Human5	0.997	0.245	0.997	1.000	0.997	0.443	0.245	0.997	0.265	0.993	0.990	0.891	
	Human7	0.855	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.328	0.308	0.833	0.290	0.295	1.000	0.446	
	Human8	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.883	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.188	0.195	0.219	
	Human9	1.000	1.000	0.862	0.803	0.498	0.685	0.774	0.521	0.725	0.639	0.282	0.321	
	Jump Kita Su C	0.082	0.082	0.025	0.074	0.066	0.451	0.041	0.074	0.057	0.066	0.082	0.066	
	Man	1.000	1.000	1,000	1.000	1.000	1,000	1,000	0.464	1 000	0.440	0.905	0.286	
	Panda	0.990	0.973	0.310	0.587	1.000	0.986	0.500	0.363	0.364	1.000	1.000	0.996	
	RedTeam	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	
	Rubik	0.489	0.897	0.397	1.000	0.536	0.821	0.982	0.457	0.969	0.156	0.307	0.359	
	Skater Skater	0.619	0.994	0.863	0.888	0.925	0.944	1.000	0.388	0.938	0.963	0.994	0.981	
	Skating2-1	0.391	0.903	0.630	0.068	0.913	0.623	0.729	0.045	0.383	0.352	0.120	0.040	
	Skating2-2	0.228	0.444	0.467	0.049	0.178	0.429	0.019	0.015	0.490	0.262	0.292	0.114	
	Surfer	1.000	1.000	0.997	0.375	0.987	0.830	0.979	1.000	0.910	0.992	0.971	0.585	
	Toy	0.915	0.830	0.963	0.952	0.745	0.878	0.893	0.959	0.985	0.690	0.897	0.214	
	Twinnings	0.315	0.298	0.274	0.476	0.210	0.339	0.210	0.218	0.306	0.250	0.226	0.185	
	Vase	0.694	0.624	0.808	0.998	0.476	0.742	0.350	0.756	0.793	0.779	0.513	0.413	
	Average	0.849	0.837	0.789	0.784	0.781	0.773	0.762	0.720	0.692	0.643	0.639	0.526	



Figure 2. Distance precision plots on OTB2015 [18] for 11 attributes, which are background cluttered (BC), deformation (DEF), fast motion (FM), in-plane rotation (IPR), illumination variation (IV), low resolution (LR), motion blur (MB), occlusion (OCC), out-of-plane rotation (OPR), out-of-view (OV) and scale variation (SV). The distance precision (DP) score is shown in the legend. Our PTAV ranks top 2 on all 11 attributes.



Figure 3. Overlap success plots on OTB2015 [18] for 11 attributes, which are background cluttered (BC), deformation (DEF), fast motion (FM), in-plane rotation (IPR), illumination variation (IV), low resolution (LR), motion blur (MB), occlusion (OCC), out-of-plane rotation (OPR), out-of-view (OV) and scale variation (SV). The title of each attribute plot contains the name of the attribute and the number of videos associated with it. The overlap success (OS) score is shown in the legend. Our PTAV ranks top 2 on all 11 attributes.

Table 3. A per-video comparison on the TC128 [9]. The best two results are highlighted with red and blue fonts (last row of table).																			
	PTAV	HCF [11]	Staple [1]	SRDCF [3]	MEEM [19]	Struck [5]	LCT [11]	fDSST [2]	KCF [6]		PTAV	HCF [11]	Staple [1]	SRDCF [3]	MEEM [19]	Struck [5]	LCT [11]	fDSST [2]	KCF [6]
David	0.992	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.985	0.975	1.000	1.000	1.000	Kite_ce2	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.600
Airport_ce	0.757	0.392	0.493	0.446	0.378	0.405	0.412	0.459	0.392	Kite_ce3	0.994	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.994	0.994
Baby_ce	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.956	0.892	0.841	1.000	0.662	Kobe_ce	0.588	0.211	0.215	0.246	0.414	0.275	0.211	0.270	0.220
Badminton_ce1	0.997	0.997	0.915	0.988	0.986	0.998	0.993	0.352	1.000	Lemming	0.939	0.258	0.273	0.323	0.908	0.776	0.856	0.275	0.275
Badminton_ce2	0.918	0.973	0.969	0.787	0.631	0.915	0.929	0.868	0.081	Liquor Logo co	0.967	0.816	0.928	0.982	0.551	0.258	0.789	0.974	0.430
Ball ce?	0.020	0.508	0.051	0.023	0.031	0.192	0.018	0.025	0.028	Matrix	0.910	0.290	0.360	0.370	0.404	0.989	0.395	0.995	0.280
Ball_ce3	0.919	0.762	0.762	0.762	0.762	0.762	0.762	0.762	0.762	Messi_ce	0.717	0.636	0.768	0.989	1.000	0.967	0.533	0.533	0.283
Ball_ce4	0.457	0.054	0.058	0.058	0.059	0.058	0.035	0.058	0.015	Michaeljackson_ce	0.573	0.316	0.575	0.623	0.565	0.656	0.455	0.575	0.776
Basketball	0.930	1.000	0.879	0.996	0.877	0.259	1.000	0.913	0.921	Microphone_ce1	0.863	0.995	0.618	1.000	0.990	1.000	1.000	0.853	1.000
Basketball_ce1	0.522	0.938	0.649	0.643	0.649	0.135	0.978	0.377	0.480	Microphone_ce2	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.602	1.000	1.000
Basketball_ce2	0.549	0.358	0.587	0.798	0.112	0.481	0.582	0.145	0.244	MotorRolling	0.104	0.945	0.055	0.043	0.043	0.159	0.043	0.043	0.049
Basketball_ce3	0.683	0.955	1.000	0.728	0.760	0.776	0.735	0.726	0.726	Motorbike_ce	0.947	0.645	0.236	0.238	0.698	0.236	0.238	0.238	0.238
Bee_ce	0.922	1.000	1.000	0.422	1.000	1.000	0.389	0.400	0.289	MountainBike	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.886	1.000	0.996	1.000	1.000
Bicycle Bika cal	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.040	0.084	1.000	1.000	1.000	Panda Plana ca?	0.033	0.555	0.080	0.681	0.525	0.300	0.382	0.033	0.033
Bike_ce?	0.180	0.988	0.138	1.000	0.248	0.164	0.472	0.167	0.548	Plate cel	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000
Biker	0.650	0.594	0.956	0.461	0.589	0.683	0.456	0.467	0.467	Plate_ce2	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000
Bikeshow_ce	0.213	0.753	0.050	0.152	0.102	0.579	0.055	0.288	0.258	Pool_ce1	0.952	0.054	0.054	0.072	1.000	1.000	0.048	0.048	0.048
Bird	0.838	0.980	0.909	0.515	0.980	0.485	0.768	0.515	0.566	Pool_ce2	0.940	0.023	0.030	0.030	1.000	1.000	0.023	0.023	0.023
Board	0.186	0.834	0.860	0.855	0.023	0.263	0.831	0.100	0.803	Pool_ce3	0.065	0.065	0.056	0.056	1.000	0.032	0.065	0.065	0.056
Boat_ce1	0.061	0.080	0.066	0.531	0.151	0.074	0.265	0.061	0.130	Railwaystation_ce	0.717	0.785	0.092	0.964	0.111	0.036	0.036	0.036	0.036
Boat_ce2	0.701	0.743	0.745	0.733	0.743	0.745	0.697	0.748	0.745	Ring_ce	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000
Bolt	0.954	1.000	1.000	0.017	0.983	0.054	1.000	0.017	0.997	Sailor_ce	0.988	1.000	1.000	0.396	1.000	1.000	0.413	0.582	0.403
Boy	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	Shaking	0.964	0.868	0.019	0.014	0.975	0.770	0.984	0.953	0.022
Busstation_cel	0.972	0.107	0.107	0.105	0.124	0.116	0.113	0.127	0.113	Singer1	1.000	0.041	1.000	1.000	0.567	0.036	1.000	1.000	1.000
CarDark	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	Singer cel	0.929	0.963	0.949	0.973	0.813	0.972	1.000	0.897	0.939
CarScale	0.813	0.627	0.841	0.778	0.714	0.690	0.730	0.813	0.806	Singer_ce2	0.257	0.057	0.790	0.053	0.802	0.007	0.393	0.133	0.275
Carchasing_ce1	0.920	0.287	0.283	0.930	0.281	0.279	0.289	0.285	0.285	Skating1	1.000	1.000	0.525	0.898	0.805	0.990	1.000	1.000	1.000
Carchasing_ce3	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	Skating2	0.446	0.871	0.823	0.774	0.226	0.298	0.798	0.038	0.588
Carchasing_ce4	1.000	0.973	1.000	1.000	0.541	0.394	0.229	1.000	0.837	Skating_ce1	0.394	0.337	0.682	0.054	0.570	0.323	0.401	0.059	0.296
Charger_ce	0.117	0.091	0.658	0.577	0.027	0.084	0.087	0.124	0.101	Skatingce2	0.087	0.284	0.433	0.052	0.151	0.052	0.087	0.099	0.072
Coke	0.966	0.962	0.887	0.818	0.945	0.811	0.914	0.897	0.852	Skiing	0.086	0.988	0.160	0.074	0.123	0.062	0.136	0.086	0.074
Couple	0.729	0.921	0.679	1.000	1.000	0.714	0.571	0.586	0.250	Skiing_ce	0.411	0.581	0.785	0.836	0.755	0.687	0.652	0.528	0.405
Crossing	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	Skyjumping_ce	0.862	0.733	0.934	0.074	0.724	0.638	0.087	0.292	0.361
Cup ce	0.038	0.012	0.021	0.018	0.015	0.015	0.018	0.038	0.041	Spiderman ce	0.083	0.490	0.353	0.954	0.268	0.014	0.151	0.940	0.060
David3	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	Subway	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000
Deer	1.000	1.000	0.831	1.000	1.000	0.901	0.817	1.000	0.887	Suitcase_ce	0.886	0.804	0.815	0.804	0.793	0.391	0.793	0.821	0.799
Diving	0.472	0.801	0.342	0.645	0.182	0.242	0.641	0.394	0.368	Sunshade	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000
Doll	0.969	0.978	0.992	0.993	0.984	0.977	0.981	0.994	0.973	SuperMario_ce	0.884	0.815	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.993	0.322	0.404	0.233
Eagle_ce	1.000	1.000	0.536	0.464	1.000	1.000	0.080	1.000	0.080	Surf_ce1	0.153	0.438	0.205	0.062	0.178	0.193	0.248	0.040	0.035
Electricalbike_ce	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	Surf_ce2	0.136	0.020	0.049	0.049	0.430	0.069	0.041	0.028	0.013
FaceOcc1	0.882	0.600	0.918	0.831	0.720	0.706	0.906	0.882	0.731	Surf_ce3	0.158	0.538	0.616	0.237	0.444	0.093	0.398	0.140	0.136
Face_ce	0.913	0.037	0.044	0.042	0.037	0.037	0.037	0.042	0.044	Surf_ce4	0.081	0.044	0.333	0.081	0.193	0.074	0.111	0.170	0.081
Fish cel	0.858	0.698	0.710	0.090	0.085	0.072	0.085	0.077	0.082	TennisBall ce	0.396	0.038	0.024	0.031	0.024	0.132	0.021	0.021	0.017
Fish_ce2	0.545	0.194	0.147	0.159	0.215	0.387	0.148	0.148	0.161	Tennis_ce1	0.991	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.989	0.993
Football1	1.000	0.973	1.000	0.784	1.000	1.000	0.973	1.000	0.986	Tennis_ce2	0.993	0.990	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.993	1.000
Girl	0.882	1.000	0.864	0.994	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.894	0.866	Tennis_ce3	0.951	0.113	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.108	0.108	0.574
Girlmov	0.962	0.075	0.075	0.075	0.983	0.227	0.075	0.075	0.075	Thunder_ce	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.704	1.000	1.000
Guitar_ce1	0.985	0.963	0.933	1.000	1.000	0.985	0.985	0.985	0.985	Tiger1	0.946	0.856	0.975	0.975	0.935	0.856	0.890	0.949	0.873
Guitar_ce2	0.543	0.840	0.514	0.508	0.454	0.719	0.524	0.543	0.575	Tiger2	0.918	0.567	0.874	0.940	0.729	0.332	0.688	0.921	0.397
Gym	0.918	0.974	0.956	0.954	0.936	0.931	0.948	0.555	0.966	Torus	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.913	1.000	1.000
riand Hand cel	0.029	0.19/	0.176	0.148	0.172	0.150	0.996	0.197	0.189	Trollis	0.501	0.279	0.079	1.000	0.084	0.104	1.000	0.086	0.084
Hand_ce?	0.958	0.964	1.000	0.896	1.000	0.988	0.916	0.853	0.637	Walking	1.000	1.000	1,000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000
Hurdle_ce1	0.957	0.993	0.707	0.973	0.730	0.993	0.700	0.967	0.983	Walking2	0.796	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.450	0.730	0.404	0.868	0.440
Hurdle_ce2	0.977	1.000	0.984	0.980	0.947	0.928	0.967	0.977	0.970	Woman	0.938	0.940	0.998	0.988	0.218	1.000	0.940	0.938	0.938
Iceskater	0.622	0.762	0.822	0.800	0.684	0.744	0.590	0.616	0.714	Yo-yos_ce1	0.298	0.102	0.115	0.140	0.217	0.111	0.153	0.094	0.136
Ironman	0.428	0.645	0.133	0.030	0.193	0.163	0.145	0.084	0.102	Yo-yos_ce2	0.716	0.216	0.357	0.216	0.361	0.733	0.222	0.216	0.222
Jogging1	0.974	0.974	0.228	0.974	0.980	0.231	0.971	0.231	0.235	Yo-yos_ce3	0.025	0.030	0.030	0.060	0.060	0.786	0.030	0.025	0.025
Juice	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.567	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	Jogging2	0.935	1.000	0.192	0.997	0.971	0.173	0.974	0.163	0.163
Kite_ce1	0.998	0.469	0.469	0.469	0.450	0.469	0.469	0.471	0.469	Average	0.741	0.705	0.667	0.663	0.641	0.614	0.606	0.575	0.551



Figure 4. Distance precision plots on TC128 [9] for 11 attributes, which are background cluttered (BC), deformation (DEF), fast motion (FM), in-plane rotation (IPR), illumination variation (IV), low resolution (LR), motion blur (MB), occlusion (OCC), out-of-plane rotation (OPR), out-of-view (OV) and scale variation (SV). The distance precision (DP) score is shown in the legend. Our PTAV ranks top 2 on all 10 of 11 attributes.



Figure 5. Overlap success plots on TC128 [9] for 11 attributes, which are background cluttered (BC), deformation (DEF), fast motion (FM), in-plane rotation (IPR), illumination variation (IV), low resolution (LR), motion blur (MB), occlusion (OCC), out-of-plane rotation (OPR), out-of-view (OV) and scale variation (SV). The title of each attribute plot contains the name of the attribute and the number of videos associated with it. The overlap success (OS) score is shown in the legend. Our PTAV ranks top 2 on all 10 of 11 attributes.

	PTAV	MUSTer [7]	SRDCF [3]	HCF [10]	MEEM [19]	SAMF [8]	Struck [5]	fDSST [2]	LCT [11]	KCF [6]
Bike1	0.456	0.406	0.330	0.579	0.576	0.395	0.156	0.449	0.349	0.138
Bird1	0.439	0.436	0.436	0.435	0.441	0.436	0.461	0.439	0.436	0.435
Car1	0.830	0.657	0.657	0.618	0.385	0.615	0.569	0.657	0.618	0.382
Car3	1.000	0.981	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.912	1.000	1.000	0.837
Car6	0.369	0.350	0.117	0.118	0.098	0.175	0.158	0.148	0.124	0.125
Car8	0.434	0.419	0.750	0.087	0.407	0.250	0.388	0.434	0.106	0.078
Car9	0.988	0.979	0.424	0.109	0.396	0.423	0.115	0.423	0.151	0.225
Car16	0.712	0.118	0.356	0.666	0.349	0.125	0.408	0.440	0.093	0.112
Group1	0.356	0.548	0.895	0.939	0.930	0.798	0.672	0.356	0.490	0.212
Group2	0.899	0.350	0.114	0.114	0.114	0.114	0.143	0.114	0.114	0.114
Group3	0.399	0.130	0.362	0.363	0.366	0.367	0.365	0.352	0.349	0.365
Person2	0.881	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.881	1.000	0.996
Person4	0.298	0.266	0.937	0.877	0.457	0.294	0.450	0.299	0.298	0.299
Person5	0.742	1.000	0.980	1.000	1.000	1.000	0.709	0.683	0.660	0.508
Person7	0.885	0.321	0.330	0.352	0.357	0.196	0.505	0.203	0.186	0.143
Person14	0.976	0.801	0.063	0.064	0.063	0.064	0.064	0.064	0.064	0.064
Person17	0.994	0.406	0.605	0.999	0.993	0.996	0.894	0.994	0.605	0.605
Person19	0.138	0.233	0.297	0.303	0.221	0.301	0.201	0.138	0.173	0.156
Person20	0.236	0.474	0.376	0.228	0.173	0.480	0.217	0.236	0.445	0.317
Uav1	0.443	0.411	0.115	0.154	0.319	0.107	0.361	0.122	0.108	0.110
Average	0.624	0.514	0.507	0.500	0.482	0.457	0.437	0.422	0.368	0.311

Table 4. A per-video comparison on the UAV20L [12]. The best two results are highlighted with **red** and **blue** fonts (last row of table).



Figure 6. Distance precision plots on UAV20L [12] for 12 attributes, which are scale variation (SV), aspect ratio change (ARC), low resolution (LR), fast motion (FM), full occlusion (FOC), partial occlusion (POC), out-of-view (OV), background clutter (BC), illumination variation (IV), viewpoint change (VC), camera motion (CM) and similar object (SOB). The distance precision (DP) score is shown in the legend. Our PTAV ranks top 1 on all 12 attributes.



Figure 7. Overlap success plots on UAV20L [12] for 12 attributes, which are scale variation (SV), aspect ratio change (ARC), low resolution (LR), fast motion (FM), full occlusion (FOC), partial occlusion (POC), out-of-view (OV), background clutter (BC), illumination variation (IV), viewpoint change (VC), camera motion (CM) and similar object (SOB). The title of each attribute plot contains the name of the attribute and the number of videos associated with it. The overlap success (OS) score is shown in the legend. Our PTAV ranks top 1 on all 12 attributes.